Result synthesis on the base X

For the non deterministic methods :
- Avg : average of the values of 10 solutions obtained on the data instance.
- Avg/Ref : relative gap between the average and the reference solution : 100×(Avg - Ref)/Ref
- Best : value of the best solution among the 10 solutions obtained on the data instance.
- Best/Ref : relative gap between the best and the reference solution : 100×(Best - Ref)/Ref
- Worst : value of the worst solution among the 10 solutions obtained on the data instance.
- Worst/Ref : relative gap between the worst and the reference solution : 100×(Worst - Ref)/Ref
- Standard deviation : standard deviation computed with the values Avg/Ref

The final grade of the candidates, taken into account by the jury, is the average of the values Avg/Ref.

For the deterministic methods :
- Solution value : value of the solution obtained on the instance
- Sol/Ref : relative gap between the solution and the reference solution : 100×(Val_sol - Ref)/Ref

The final grade of the candidates, taken into account by the jury, is the average of the values Sol/Ref.

Remark : All the solutions obtained are feasible.

TNO-PEL : Kuipers

Instance	Avg	Avg/Ref (%)	Best	Best / Ref (%)	Worst	Worst/Ref (%)	Standard deviation
2_28_111	872246792	35.87	875447480	36.37	870235760	35.56	0.3
2_28_140	833061980	20.91	833286609	20.94	831040320	20.62	0.1
2_28_155	952267030	26.15	952267030	26.15	952267030	26.15	0.0
2_28_170	952144183	47.92	957935459	48.82	937584519	45.66	0.9
2_28_37	987549761	56.03	992155179	56.76	973995360	53.89	1.2
2_28_66	945409350	37.69	945737319	37.74	944644089	37.58	0.1
2_28_7	977811340	36.78	977811340	36.78	977811340	36.78	0.0
2_28_81	878847950	20.69	878847950	20.69	878847950	20.69	0.0
3_28_155	457063785	20.12	462070340	21.44	450543180	18.41	1.5
3_28_96	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	0.0
Synthesis	-	**31.76**	-	32.12	-	31.08	0.4

HEC : Cordeau, Laporte

Instance	Avg	Avg/Ref (%)	Best	Best / Ref (%)	Worst	Worst/Ref (%)	Standard deviation
2_28_111	863378847	34.49	870235760	35.56	848725440	32.21	1.0
2_28_140	830212363	20.50	833286609	20.94	829015496	20.32	0.2
2_28_155	941946991	24.78	952267030	26.15	938034630	24.27	0.6
2_28_170	945346868	46.86	963809499	49.73	934719500	45.21	1.5
2_28_37	962143842	52.02	975346580	54.11	927942820	46.62	2.3
2_28_66	943683278	37.44	945737319	37.74	941805619	37.17	0.2
2_28_7	971491820	35.89	977811340	36.78	926643639	29.62	2.3
2_28_81	872464834	19.82	878847950	20.69	849750630	16.70	1.5
3_28_155	462070340	21.44	462070340	21.44	462070340	21.44	0.0
3_28_96	456688588	15.12	458107362	15.48	443919627	11.90	1.1
Synthesis	-	**30.84**	-	31.86	-	28.54	1.1

LGI2P-EMA-EERIE : Vasquez, Vimont, Vlasak

Instance	Solution value	Gap (Sol-Ref)/Ref (%)
2_28_111	875447480	36.37
2_28_140	833286609	20.94
2_28_155	943246350	24.96
2_28_170	894240134	38.92
2_28_37	948928620	49.93
2_28_66	942852869	37.32
2_28_7	977811340	36.78
2_28_81	878847950	20.69
3_28_155	461812490	21.37
3_28_96	458107362	15.48
Synthesis	-	**30.28**

DIRO-CRT : Gendreau, Jaumard, Morales

Instance	Avg	Avg/Ref (%)	Best	Best / Ref (%)	Worst	Worst/Ref (%)	Standard deviation
2_28_111	863790623	34.55	870800245	35.64	862465188	34.35	0.4
2_28_140	833286609	20.94	833286609	20.94	833286609	20.94	0.0
2_28_155	948878187	25.70	952267030	26.15	942108103	24.80	0.6
2_28_170	933802526	45.07	945916919	46.95	907878477	41.04	1.7
2_28_37	968734316	53.06	975346579	54.11	954462139	50.81	1.0
2_28_66	922799918	34.40	945737319	37.74	915931939	33.40	1.4
2_28_7	928260089	29.84	970197320	35.71	914943390	27.98	2.2
2_28_81	877743762	20.54	878847950	20.69	875167325	20.19	0.2
3_28_155	462070340	21.44	462070340	21.44	462070340	21.44	0.0
3_28_96	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	0.0
Synthesis	-	**30.10**	-	31.49	-	29.04	0.8

POZNAN Univ. : Jaszkiewicz

Instance	Avg	Avg/Ref (%)	Best	Best / Ref (%)	Worst	Worst/Ref (%)	Standard deviation
2_28_111	869692823	35.47	870235760	35.56	865024040	34.74	0.3
2_28_140	828521213	20.25	829249100	20.36	828074889	20.19	0.1
2_28_155	938034630	24.27	938034630	24.27	938034630	24.27	0.0
2_28_170	926855898	43.99	936642850	45.51	914893238	42.13	1.4
2_28_37	963335931	52.21	965003900	52.47	959987550	51.68	0.3
2_28_66	913881099	33.10	940525600	36.98	885398595	28.95	3.3
2_28_7	945351762	32.23	970995560	35.82	929962840	30.08	2.6
2_28_81	878326778	20.62	878847950	20.69	873636230	19.98	0.2
3_28_155	462070340	21.44	462070340	21.44	462070340	21.44	0.0
3_28_96	458107226	15.48	458107362	15.48	458106682	15.48	0.0
Synthesis	-	**29.91**	-	30.86	-	28.89	0.8

LGI2P-EMA-EERIE : Habet, Vasquez (Junior)

Instance	Solution value	Gap (Sol-Ref)/Ref (%)
2_28_111	867428330	35.12
2_28_140	833286609	20.94
2_28_155	932560330	23.54
2_28_170	927955418	44.16
2_28_37	942451230	48.91
2_28_66	924703269	34.68
2_28_7	977811340	36.78
2_28_81	857252940	17.73
3_28_155	462070340	21.44
3_28_96	458107362	15.48
Synthesis	-	**29.88**

IME-USP : Ribeiro, Goldman (Junior)

Instance	Avg	Avg/Ref (%)	Best	Best / Ref (%)	Worst	Worst/Ref (%)	Standard deviation
2_28_111	852204118	32.75	858004675	33.65	841981640	31.16	0.6
2_28_140	829645685	20.41	831040320	20.62	828074889	20.19	0.1
2_28_155	931095342	23.35	938373530	24.31	927242330	22.84	0.5
2_28_170	915863594	42.28	932138480	44.81	904400510	40.50	1.5
2_28_37	958087203	51.38	973054100	53.74	940314360	48.57	2.1
2_28_66	932027489	35.75	942852870	37.32	926621030	34.96	1.0
2_28_7	977811340	36.78	977811340	36.78	977811340	36.78	0.0
2_28_81	865220445	18.82	871384055	19.67	855341325	17.46	0.8
3_28_155	461812490	21.37	461812490	21.37	461812490	21.37	0.0
3_28_96	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	0.0
Synthesis	-	**29.84**	-	30.77	-	28.93	0.7

TNO-PEL : Bloemen

Instance	Avg	Avg/Ref (%)	Best	Best / Ref(%)	Worst	Worst/Ref (%)	Standard deviation
2_28_111	868193766	35.24	870235834	35.56	862434334	34.34	0.5
2_28_140	829512069	20.40	833286609	20.94	828074889	20.19	0.2
2_28_155	943030188	24.93	943585250	25.00	938034630	24.27	0.2
2_28_170	937169262	45.59	937881019	45.70	935063484	45.27	0.2
2_28_37	964842878	52.45	980558299	54.93	952367180	50.47	1.4
2_28_66	942232937	37.23	945737319	37.74	937641149	36.56	0.4
2_28_7	974403450	36.30	977811340	36.78	970995559	35.82	0.5
2_28_81	877954352	20.57	878847950	20.69	872897250	19.88	0.3
3_28_155	427512938	12.35	444110331	16.72	411627020	8.18	2.3
3_28_96	443496867	11.80	449263070	13.25	439721670	10.84	1.0
Synthesis	-	**29.69**	-	30.73	-	28.58	0.7

ID-IMAG : Da Costa, Dutot, Mounié, Parmentier, Wild (Junior)

Instance	Avg	Avg/Ref (%)	Best	Best / Ref (%)	Worst	Worst/Ref (%)	Standard deviation
2_28_111	849464068	32.32	867645980	35.15	822222810	28.08	2.4
2_28_140	833286609	20.94	833286610	20.94	833286609	20.94	0.0
2_28_155	942237896	24.82	943585250	25.00	938034630	24.27	0.3
2_28_170	924344724	43.60	940709399	46.14	911280620	41.57	1.2
2_28_37	945523412	49.39	970280200	53.31	931901374	47.24	1.8
2_28_66	898670137	30.89	927269679	35.05	882049320	28.47	2.2
2_28_7	977129762	36.68	977811340	36.78	970995559	35.82	0.3
2_28_81	878111824	20.59	878847950	20.69	875167325	20.19	0.2
3_28_155	447072156	17.49	450543580	18.41	446204300	17.27	0.5
3_28_96	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	458107362	15.48	0.0
Synthesis	-	**29.22**	-	30.70	-	27.93	0.9

BOUYGUES : Caseau

Instance	Solution value	Gap (Sol-Ref)/Ref (%)
2_28_111	854994860	33.18
2_28_140	828074890	20.19
2_28_155	932454050	23.53
2_28_170	925772900	43.82
2_28_37	945617600	49.41
2_28_66	918358259	33.75
2_28_7	965783840	35.09
2_28_81	859021950	17.97
3_28_155	450543180	18.41
3_28_96	458106682	15.48
Synthesis	-	**29.08**

THALES-INRA : de Givry, Jeannin

Instance	Solution value	Gap (Sol-Ref)/Ref (%)
2_28_111	835147061	30.09
2_28_140	744925037	8.12
2_28_155	938373530	24.31
2_28_170	864641967	34.33
2_28_37	904652400	42.94
2_28_66	853647965	24.33
2_28_7	908628252	27.10
2_28_81	848314597	16.50
3_28_155	427600900	12.38
3_28_96	458107362	15.48
Synthesis	-	**23.56**